

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 26 October 2023 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 20 October 2023.

Present: County Councillor Molik (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ahmed, Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Brown-Reckless, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hinchey, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Jones, K Jones, Joyce, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lay, Lent, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Lloyd Jones, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Jackie Parry, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Huw Thomas, Thomson, Lynda Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams and Wood

60 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Brown-Reckless, Elsmore, Goodway, Keith Jones, Owen Jones, Joyce, Lewis and Wong.

61 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were received in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

NAME	AGENDA ITEM NO	NATURE OF INTEREST	REASON FOR INTEREST
Cllr Ali Ahmed Cllr Ash-Edwards Cllr Berman Cllr Boes Cllr Carr Cllr Chowdhury Cllr Cowan Cllr Davies Cllr De'Ath Cllr Driscoll Cllr Furguson-Thorne Cllr Gibson Cllr Jackie Jones Cllr Latif Cllr Lay Cllr Lewis	Item 8	Personal	Members of the Cardiff & Vale Pension Fund

Cllr Littlechild Cllr Livesy Cllr McEvoy Cllr Melbourne Cllr Merry Cllr Michael Cllr Naughton Cllr Owen Cllr Palmer Cllr Proctor Cllr Reid-Jones Cllr Robson Cllr Singh Cllr Taylor Cllr Thomson Cllr Thomas Cllr Waldron Cllr Weaver Cllr Wild Cllr Williams Cllr Wood			
Cllr Neil McEvoy	Various	Personal	Employment can involve Children's Services and Housing Disrepair issues
Cllr Calum Davies	Item 9	Personal	Employed by a Housing Developer
Cllr Calum Davies	Items 8 & 9	Personal	Non-Exec Director of Cardiff Bus
Cllr Gary Hunt	Items 8 & 9	Personal	Non-Exec Director of Cardiff Bus
Cllr Chris Lay	Items 8 & 9	Personal	Non-Exec Director of Cardiff Bus
Cllr Rhys Taylor	Items 8 & 9	Personal	Non-Exec Director of Cardiff Bus

62 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting on 21 September 2023 were approved and signed by the Chair subject to the amendment of minute 50: the reply from Councillor Wild to Councillor Lancaster at the bottom of page 28 – 'Yes, we are going to commit to that'.

The minutes of the meeting on 12 October were approved and signed by the Chair.

63 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

*Leia Farewell to Cllr De'Ath, Cabinet Member for Transport and Strategic Planning*

Near where I live in Danescourt, there is a wild forest area just south of Hermit Woods that is very important to me. After long school days spent indoors, I can walk along winding trails through the trees, pick blackberries and see rabbits, birds and

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

butterflies. There are so few of these truly wild spaces left in our city. What is the council doing to protect these spaces?

*Reply – Cllr De’Ath*

Wild spaces are really important to health, wellbeing and particularly mental health. This is something as a county that we want to try and protect and cherish, particularly as we’ve acknowledged a nature and climate emergency going on. In planning terms, green infrastructure is a key part of our local development plan, which sets out where we want things and where we don’t want things. There is guidance within that plan around green infrastructure, and at the moment we’re putting together a new plan to see us through the next few years, so we’re undertaking a green infrastructure assessment. This will look at all the wild places in the city and what we can do to protect them, in order to strengthen our policies in the future. We’ll be consulting on that next year so please do make your views known by taking part. It’s something we really hold dear, but that being said, we’re not saying that you can never do anything at all on that sort of infrastructure, just that it has to be sensitive and with proportionate mitigation in place. It’s something that we take very seriously and will do our best to protect.

*Supplementary question – Leia Farewell*

Thank you, I appreciate you answering my question and I love that you agree that wild spaces should be protected. For the sake of me and my friends, will you commit to do all that you can to protect these wild spaces, particularly my little woods, from the new local development plan, and will you commit to coming in person to see for yourself why I love it so much, and why I’m so worried about the threat of development running right through it?

*Reply – Cllr De’Ath*

Hopefully the local development plan won’t be a threat but will actually enhance areas like this. Your local councillors, Cllrs Jenkins and Driscoll, are very passionate environmentalists. I’d love to come and have a look at the area you’ve mentioned, along with the two local Members.

64 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were received.

Presented by	Number of relevant signatures	Nature of petition
Cllr Carter	439	Calling on the Council and Cardiff Bus to withdrawn plans to axe the 51 – 53 Bus Service
Cllr Driscoll	2021	Calling on the Council not to allow building on the River Taff Corridor (LDP)
Cllr McEvoy	228	Calling on the Council to refurbish the play area at Mill Park, Ely
Cllr McEvoy	857	Calling on the Council to halt cuts to Cardiff Bus Services and carry out a full review

65 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Lord Mayor thanked those involved in making all of her recent engagements so special as she reached the halfway point of her tenure; and those that had supported the various fundraising events which had been organised in aid of her chosen charity, UCAN Productions.

There were currently three further events coming up:

18th November – Cllr Joel Williams was organising a coffee morning.

26th November – there would be a dinner event at Mercure Hotel organised by some of the leading ladies from across Cardiff's diverse communities.

19th December – there would be a fundraising concert at the Royal Welsh College of Music & Drama.

The Lord Mayor added that she felt it would be wrong not to speak about the situation in Gaza, Palestine and Israel:

*“The battle between safe-land and home-land has been going on for almost a century in this part of the world. We may think and feel that problems in the Middle East will not impact us here in UK or Cardiff, but we are very wrong to assume that. We are seeing anti-Muslim and anti-Semitic attacks here in UK as a result of what is happening in the Middle East. And indeed there are people who have family members or loved ones, UK citizens, trapped in the conflict.*

*As many may know I follow the Muslim faith. I was educated in a Catholic school and have friends of all faiths and none. As Lord Mayor I have attended multiple places of worship and been part of different religious events and festivals. I am very aware of teachings of different faiths, and all faiths value life over all else. Of course faiths tell us to defend ourselves, but defending ourselves should not translate to harm to unarmed civilians, women and children. Lessons need to be learnt from our history: war, hate and divisions do not resolve any problem.*

*As we approach November, the month of remembrance, we should not forget what happened in our past and what war and hate led to. I was listening to the radio and a son was speaking, a son whose mother is amongst the captives, and he stated ‘my mother would happily die for peace, but does not want to be the reason for war’ and that comment really did make me think: we have tried war; let us push for peace.*

*It is important that our political figureheads in the UK advocate for a peaceful end to the conflict. It is also important that here we stay united, as I know in Cardiff we celebrate diversity and unite across all differences and look out for one another, as there is more that unites us than divides us. Thank you all.”*

66 : TREASURY MANAGEMENT ANNUAL REPORT 2022/2023

Council was provided with the Treasury Management Annual Report for 2022/2023.

The report was proposed by Councillor Chris Weaver and seconded by Councillor Thomas.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendation contained in the report, namely to note the report which appeared at Appendix 1.

FOR (66)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Hinchey, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Lloyd Jones, Jackie Jones, Lancaster, Latif, Lay, Lent, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Parry, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams and Wood

AGAINST (1)

Councillor McEvoy

There were no abstentions.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Note the Treasury Management Annual Report 2022/2023.

67 : STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS 2022/23 - CARDIFF AND VALE OF GLAMORGAN PENSION FUND

Council was asked to approve the Statement of Accounts for 2022/23 in order to meet the requirements of the Accounts and Audit (Wales) Regulations 2014.

The report was proposed by Councillor Weaver and seconded by Councillor Merry.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendations.

FOR (67)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Lloyd Jones, Jackie Jones, Kaaba, Lancaster, Lay, Lent, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Mackie, McEvoy, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Parry, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams and Wood

The vote was unanimous.

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

1. Approve the audited Statement of Accounts 2022/23 – The Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund (Appendix 1).
2. Note the Audit of Accounts Reports (ISA 260) from Audit Wales on the Statement of Accounts of Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund for the year ending 31 March 2023 (Appendix 2).
3. Note the final Letter of Representation for the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund included within Appendix 2.
4. Note that the following documents will be signed following the conclusion of the meeting:
  - Statement of Accounts for Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pensions Fund – Lord Mayor and Corporate Director Resources
  - Audit Certificate for the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pensions Fund – Appointed Auditor, Audit Wales
  - Letter of Representation for the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund – Lord Mayor and Chief Executive

68 : SEVENTH CARDIFF LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN ANNUAL MONITORING REPORT

Council was provided with the Seventh Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report and asked to endorse the report for submission to the Welsh Government by 31st October 2023.

The report was proposed by Councillor De’Ath and seconded by Councillor Huw Thomas.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendation.

FOR (58)

Councillors Ali Ahmed, Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Ash-Edwards, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cunnah, De’Ath, Derbyshire, Ebrahim, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Lloyd Jones, Jackie Jones, Kaaba, Latif, Lay, Lent, Lister, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Naughton, Palmer, Parry, Proctor, Robinson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Simmons, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild and Wood

AGAINST (11)

Councillors Cowan, Davies, Driscoll, Lancaster, Littlechild, McEvoy, Melbourne, Owen, Reid-Jones, Robson and Williams

There were no abstentions.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Endorse the seventh AMR for submission to the Welsh Government by 31<sup>st</sup> October 2023.

69 : APPOINTMENT OF INTERIM MONITORING OFFICER, INTERIM DEPUTY RETURNING OFFICER AND INTERIM DEPUTY ELECTORAL REGISTRATION OFFICER

Council was asked to designate an Interim Monitoring Officer and Interim Deputy Returning Officer to discharge the statutory responsibilities of these posts after the current post-holder, the Director of Governance and Legal Services, left the employment of the Council.

Council was also asked to designate, as Accountable Body for the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal (CCRCD) Joint Committee, an Interim Monitoring Officer for the CCRCD Joint Committee after the current post-holder, the Operational Manager, Litigation and Deputy Monitoring Officer, left the Council; and appoint an Interim Deputy Electoral Registration Officer to cover the statutory responsibilities of this post during the temporary absence of the Chief Executive, who was the Council's appointed Electoral Registration Officer.

The report was proposed by Councillor Thomas and seconded by Councillor Merry.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report.

The Lord Mayor called for a vote on the recommendations.

FOR (64)

Councillors Saleh Ahmed, Ali, Berman, Boes, Bowen-Thomson, Bradbury, Bridgeman, Burke, Carr, Carter, Chowdhury, Cowan, Cunnah, Davies, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Driscoll, Ferguson-Thorne, Gibson, Green, Gunter, Henshaw, Hopkins, Humphreys, Hunt, Jenkins, Lloyd Jones, Jackie Jones, Kaaba, Lancaster, Latif, Lay, Lent, Lister, Littlechild, Livesy, Mackie, McGarry, Melbourne, Merry, Michael, Moultrie, Naughton, Owen, Palmer, Parry, Proctor, Reid-Jones, Robinson, Robson, Sangani, Sattar, Shimmin, Singh, Stubbs, Taylor, Thomas, Thomson, Thorne, Waldron, Weaver, Wild, Williams and Wood

AGAINST (1)

Councillor McEvoy

There were no abstentions.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

1. Designate Debbie Marles, the Monitoring Officer of the Vale of Glamorgan Council, as Interim Monitoring Officer for Cardiff Council with effect from 27th October 2023 until such time as the new Director of Governance and Legal Services and Monitoring Officer takes up their position, subject to conclusion of a Service  
*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

- Level Agreement (SLA) with the Vale of Glamorgan Council (to be concluded under recommendation 2 below);
2. Delegate authority to the Corporate Director Resources, with advice from the Director of Governance and Legal Services (or her authorised representative), to conclude an SLA with the Vale of Glamorgan Council for the provision of Interim Monitoring Officer services (as referred to in recommendation 1 above) upon appropriate terms, including those set out in paragraph 12 of the report;
  3. Note that, as part of the previously agreed recruitment and selection process, an Appointments Committee will be convened to appoint a new Director of Governance and Legal Services under its approved terms of reference, and that a further report will be brought back to a future meeting of Council to note the appointment and for Council to designate the new appointee as the Council's Monitoring Officer pursuant to section 5 of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989;
  4. Agree that, until a new Director of Governance and Legal Services is in post, other responsibilities of the post (aside from the Monitoring Officer functions which are to be discharged under the Interim MO arrangements set out above), including exercise of delegated powers under the Scheme of Delegations (including, without limitation to, those set out in Section 4E of the Scheme) and or delegations from Council, Cabinet or any of its Committees, are to be discharged temporarily by the appropriate Operational Manager/s within Governance and Legal Services with responsibility for the relevant matters, or, in their absence, by any of the Operational Managers within Governance and Legal Services.
  - 4.A Agree that, until a new Operational Manager, Litigation, is in post, all delegated powers of this post (under the Scheme of Delegations and or delegations from Council, Cabinet or any of its Committees), may be exercised by any of the Operational Managers within Legal Services.
  5. Designate Jayne La Grua as:
    - (i) Interim Deputy Monitoring Officer for the CCRCD with effect from 27th October 2023; and
    - (ii) Interim Monitoring Officer for the CCRCD with effect from 1st November 2023,

Subject to the terms of the Service Level Agreement for Legal Services being amended (pursuant to recommendation 6 below) to reflect the new arrangements for Cardiff's provision of an Interim Monitoring Officer for the CCRCD, as set out in the report (paragraphs 16-21 inclusive);

6. Subject to approval of recommendation 5, delegate authority to the Director of Governance and Legal Services (or her authorised representative), to amend the terms of the SLA for Legal Services for the CCRCD (as referred to in recommendation 5 above) to reflect the new Interim Monitoring Officer appointment; and

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*



7. Appoint the Corporate Director Resources as:
- (i) Interim Deputy Returning Officer for the election of County Councillors and Community Councillors within the administrative area of Cardiff (under section 35(1A) of the Representation of the People Act 1983) with effect from 27th October 2023 (being the date on which the Director of Governance and Legal Services leaves the Council) and until such time as the Chief Executive, as the Council's appointed Returning Officer, reviews the position and appoints any alternative deputy; and
  - (ii) Interim Deputy Electoral Registration Officer (under section 8(2A) of the Representation of the People Act 1983) to ensure there is effective cover for the statutory responsibilities of this post until the Chief Executive's return.

## 70 : CABINET STATEMENTS

### Leader's Statement

Cllr Thomas responded to questions in relation to:

- the National Care Service of Wales
- the Cardiff Public Service Board
- Twinning arrangements and value for money

### Transport & Strategic Planning Statement

Cllr De'Ath responded to questions in relation to:

- public rights of way for ramblers
- accommodations for kayakers on the River Taf
- winter preparedness
- Cardiff Bus
- the consultation process for the Replacement Local Development Plan
- the Cardiff bus priority plan

### Education Statement

Cllr Merry responded to questions in relation to:

- ensuring direct input from children and young people with disabilities as part of Cardiff's UNICEF child-friendly city commitments
- locking gates of children's play areas

### Social Services Statement

Cllrs Lister and Mackie responded to questions in relation to:

- bolstering access to domiciliary care to avoid a two-tier system
- offering the best possible support for families

### Climate Change Statement

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

Cllr Wild responded to questions in relation to:

- the rollout of segregated recycling across the city
- Christmas tree collections
- the impact of strike action on waste and recycling services

Culture, Parks & Events Statement

Cllr Burke responded to questions in relation to:

- plans in place to handle increased road traffic at Euro 2028
- the economic benefits of co-hosting the tournament
- locking gates of children's play areas
- the delivery of the Llanrumney skate park

Finance, Modernisation & Performance Statement

Cllr Weaver responded to questions in relation to:

- the availability of Connect to Cardiff services over the phone
- Living Wage Week 2023 and Anti-Slavery Day
- the council staff pay dispute

Housing & Communities Statement

Cllr Thorne responded to questions in relation to:

- CCTV surveillance to prevent theft and antisocial behaviour
- temporary accommodation

Investment & Development Statement

In the absence of Cllr Goodway, Cllr Thomas responded to questions in relation to:

- the expected timetable for the arrival of PwC in Cardiff
- antisocial behaviour and a lack of cleanliness in the city centre

Tackling Poverty, Equality & Public Health Statement

Cllrs Sangani and Bradbury responded to questions in relation to:

- locality and youth working
- when warm rooms and welcome spaces would reopen
- the Cost of Living Task Force
- the availability of information regarding the Fuel Poverty Foundation

## 71 : ORAL QUESTIONS

*Councillor Driscoll to Councillor Wild*

A number of residents have contacted me to ask: Can the Cabinet Member list the number of requests from the Police regarding details of the drivers of Council operated vehicles that have been issued notices of intended prosecution (NIP) for alleged speeding as a result of being caught by the new speed camera on the

junction of Western Avenue/Excelsior Road, and also list the number of repeat requests for the same individuals since the camera has been in operation?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

Since the 1st of June this year, the Council has received a total of 38 notices of intended prosecutions for alleged offences by drivers of Council vehicles at the A48 Western Avenue junction, but we are unable to list the number of repeat requests for individuals as the vehicles aren't necessarily always driven by the same person.

*Supplementary question – Cllr Driscoll*

Between 26th June when the camera was first turned on to 30th July, notices were issued in the following seven days, when the 30mph notice was mysteriously put up on the camera. The first three days there were 4,293 notices issued; in the following seven days, when the 30mph sign was put on the camera, there were only 623 notices of intended prosecution. This clearly shows that if the vast majority of drivers were alerted to the changes less people would have been fined, including possibly some of our hard-pressed staff. Do you agree that additional signage and information could have saved people an awful lot of stress and money which they can ill afford?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

I'm going to have to defer, this is one for Highways and technical experts, I'm not going to get into whether the sign is correct, that's for them to do. I'm happy to raise that as I'm sure you have done yourself.

*Councillor Naughton to Councillor Burke*

At a public meeting in August organised by the Save Pentwyn Leisure Centre group, the Cabinet Member and officer in attendance suggested that for original plans were consulted with the public and there was a lot of negative feedback against working to assent these changes, so I'm just going to put my question, when will we know if these changes are going to come into place?

*Reply – Cllr Burke*

The Council is currently developing a revised proposal for the refurbishment of Pentwyn Leisure Centre which will include a swimming pool that is 25 metres by 12 metres and has a depth of 104 metres. I'm hopeful that the details of the new proposal will be ready to be displayed to the public to view at Pentwyn Leisure Centre within the next two weeks, subject to the associated costs being within approved budgets.

*Supplementary - Councillor Naughton*

In a recent Labour leaflet delivered in the local area and Llanedeyrn, it did confirm that the pool would be opened in 2024. I just wanted to have the Cabinet Member's confirmation it will definitely be open at the end of 2024 for the swimming pool.

*Reply – Cllr Burke*

I haven't seen that and I don't know where that's come from. Obviously we had a briefing within the last two weeks, and I think you'll appreciate, yourself and your ward colleagues and Councillor Moultrie as well will appreciate the works that are to be undertaken are quite extensive. I would hope that we can undertake the work

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

quite quickly once the budgets are approved, but I'm not going to pin myself down to a date until we get those plans out in the first instance.

*Councillor Ali to Councillor Thorne*

Can the Cabinet Member provide an update on the Lydstep Flats works?

*Reply – Cllr Thorne*

I'm pleased to confirm that the works to refurbish the three high rise housing blocks Lydstep Flats in Llandaff North are nearing completion. These works include the provision of new external cladding, replacement windows, doors and balconies, and the installation of fire sprinklers. This will improve the thermal performance of the building and ensure the safety of our tenants. Improvements are also being made to the lighting and parking around the blocks. It is already clear that the refurbishment works are of a very high standard and the scheme will not only significantly improve the appearance and energy efficiency of the high rise blocks, but will also reduce tenants' energy bills, and will also enhance the wider neighbourhood. Whilst the overall project has slipped by several months due to the complexity of the scheme, we expect the scaffolding to be removed from the first block before Christmas and the other two blocks will follow shortly afterwards, and the contractors have informed us that they will have left the site completely by mid-April next year.

*Councillor Driscoll on behalf of Councillor Cowan to Councillor Thomas*

I have written to the Council asking if they will be flying the Israeli Flag. I received no response initially, but I continued to chase. Sadly I haven't received a response to this question, just a generalised answer. Can I ask if you will agree to fly the flag in support of Israel in line with the UK Government and several other Councils in the United Kingdom?

*Reply – Cllr Huw Thomas*

The events of recent weeks in Israel and Gaza have seen horrors beyond our imagination and I want to first of all express my deep sorrow for the ongoing loss of life and suffering on both sides. I have no hesitation in condemning the terrorist attacks and abductions carried out by Hamas as horrendous and unjustifiable. The Council held a minute's silence at the extraordinary meeting that was held here on 12th October to remember and honour the innocent lives that have been lost to date, and prior to the start of this meeting it was wonderful to hear prayers from three different faiths all calling for peace.

The challenges affecting individuals, families and communities are heart-wrenching and I appreciate the request from Councillor Cowan to fly the flag. I see it as an attempt to draw attention to this situation and to show solidarity with the very real pain and fear being felt by the city's Jewish community, a sentiment which I fully understand. We do also need to recognise that there are Palestinian families who are now suffering as a consequence of the continued violence within Gaza, and I know there are many people here in Cardiff whose relatives are currently under fire in Gaza.

Requests to fly or project the image of a national flag over Cardiff Council buildings are considered on a case by case basis by Council officers in consultation with myself as Leader of the Council. Now, given the complexities and polarising

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

nature of the current conflict, we have to consider the wider implications of doing so, which may be seen as taking a particular stance on the ongoing situation and potentially causing division within our diverse communities here in Cardiff. My sombre analysis is that a flying an Israeli flag at this point, or indeed a Palestinian one, would inflame tensions between communities in Cardiff at a time when our focus must be on supporting all communities and ensuring continued cohesion within our city.

I believe our collective responsibility is to focus on promoting peace, dialogue and understanding between those communities, and that is why, over the course of the last week, as Leader of the Council, I have been speaking with faith leaders and communities to let them know that we in Cardiff stand united. Last week I wrote to faith leaders across the city to offer my personal support as Leader and a commitment that Cardiff Council stands ready to help. I was deeply moved and pleased to be able to join community, business and other political leaders on Sunday at a vigil held in St Martin's Church in Roath, and then on Tuesday I met again with faith and community leaders to hear how the crisis is impacting on our local communities.

I also want to reassure members that Council officers and the cohesion team in particular, and our public service partners, have been engaging with local synagogues and mosques, as well as community organisations and schools over recent weeks. To help foster continued dialogue between the Council and our local communities, I would be happy to work with colleagues in this Chamber to consider other ways to mark the sorrow and tragedy that is affecting all sides and underline our shared yearning for peace. I understand, Councillor Driscoll, Councillor Cowan, this is a difficult subject that affects many of our residents and I am open to further discussions on how we can properly address this.

*Supplementary – Cllr Driscoll*

Officers have kindly agreed that Cllr Cowan can send a written supplementary to the Leader. I just want to take this opportunity to thank you for your sincere words.

*Councillor Berman to Councillor De'Ath*

In relation to the administration's proposal for a road user payment scheme, does it consider that the primary objective is 1) to reduce traffic congestion on the city's roads, 2) to generate a revenue stream to provide improved public transport provision in the city, or 3) to improve air quality?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

The road user payment project is still at a very formative stage of the business case and no decisions have been made as to what type of scheme it might be. The objectives were set out in the Cabinet report, that will be reviewed as part of the ongoing process including the consultation, so essentially in terms of our study work all those objectives were given equal weight at the moment.

*Supplementary – Cllr Berman*

I'm slightly taken aback by the fact you're saying that you're giving equal weight to all three, because the fact is that they're not all mutually achievable. If you have a scheme that does take traffic off the roads and therefore reduces congestion, then

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

you're not going to get so much income because the cars aren't using the roads, they're not therefore paying the charge, and if you're looking at something like a ULEZ scheme where you're trying to tackle air quality, than what you might do is you might just get people switching from more polluting vehicles to less polluting vehicles so again not necessarily reducing congestion and not necessarily therefore generating a huge amount in income to the Council to invest in public transport. So the fact of the matter is you can't achieve all three and therefore I am very concerned that you're trying to say that you are trying to achieve all three and therefore, it beggars belief as to why you're bring this forward when you don't know what you want to achieve. So would you not agree that the Council really needs to decide what it wants out of this scheme in order to design it accordingly?

*Reply – Cllr De’Ath*

I certainly don't deny that there are inherent tensions in some of this, and going forward we'll narrow it down to a smaller and smaller set of options. The way we engage with people and what they say to us, what businesses say to us, will genuinely shape the outcome of this project. I'd like to know, and I mean this seriously, what do you think your priority is? This will be almost a dialectical process and at the end we're talking about a synthesis of all the competing views and factors.

*Councillor Chowdhury to Councillor Sangani*

What are we doing to encourage staff to get their COVID and flu vaccinations?

*Reply – Cllr Sangani*

Information on flu and Covid-19 autumn booster vaccination was communicated to the Council staff by e-mail on 15th of September. This includes legitimate eligibility criteria and are linked to the relevant page of Public Health Wales website. Frontline health and social care workers including domiciliary care staff have been provided with additional advice, including a copy of a letter that all eligible staff can take to their own chosen community pharmacy to access the flu vaccination. In addition, the adult housing and community director has agreed to fund the flu vaccination for the specific cohort of frontline staff who deliver services to vulnerable adults but who are not eligible for the flu vaccination under the guidance from Public Health Wales. Information has been communicated with those staff members concerned. The cost will be administered through the Council's payments system. Adult Services staff has also been working with a colleague from Cardiff and Vale University Health Board and public health bodies to raise awareness of the importance of taking up the flu and the Covid vaccination.

*Councillor Lancaster to Councillor Sangani*

What is being done to encourage disabled visitors to Cardiff City Centre?

*Reply – Cllr Sangani*

The Council is working to further improve remaining accessibility across the city to better accommodate all users, including disabled people. The Council facilitates access to the city centre for disabled people in a number of ways, including provision of dedicated blue badge disabled parking bays at a number of city centre locations such as Windsor Place, as well as other locations such as attractions like National Museum of Wales. Blue badge holders are able to park free of charge at pay and

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

display across the city without a time limit. They can also park in any parking place for a period of three hours. Other good examples of progress being made to improve access include the recent improvement of North Street including state of the art bus stop cycleway crossing facilities. Improvements to other city centre bus stops along the same lines are currently being designed to make sure that especially partially sighted as well as mobility impaired people feel safer when they alight and board a bus. This is also a project to improve and update way of finding the signage when taking a bus in the city centre.

Along with the Cardiff Council, there is a mobility buggy available, Cardiff Mobility Buggies, free of service, which is available in the city centre, where people can go online and book it there. There is a dementia friendly organisation place in the city centre and they really work well if the people come with various demands, and this includes Cardiff Castle, Cardiff Central Library, National Museum Cardiff and Sherman Theatre etc. Cardiff Central Library Hub also has various material features like building extremely accessible to the visitor including accessible toilets, building navigation map for blind and partially sighted people, hearing loss advice services, blue badge application, like various ways we are doing. But if you have any specific concern, please feel free to reach out to me, I'm always happy to help.

*Supplementary – Cllr Lancaster*

Shopmobility is a national charity which looks to locate itself within town centres and provide equipment for people with mobility problems, so physically disabled people, to hire the equipment to be able to get around a city centre easily. At the moment we have no Shopmobility scheme within Cardiff, which I think is a great oversight. There is something very similar in St David's shopping centre but that only exists for the confines of the shopping centre, there is nothing to address accessibility for people within the wider open air city centre. So is that something you could look at in future please, to work with stakeholders such as For Cardiff and the Shopmobility charity, to see what we can do to improve the provision of equipment for people with physical disabilities if they want to visit the city centre.

*Reply – Cllr Sangani*

I am definitely looking forward to having a meeting with them if I can.

*Councillor Berman to Councillor Wild*

Following the recently reported admission by Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water that it has been illegally spilling untreated sewage from 10 different treatment plants in Wales, what guarantees has the Council subsequently sought and obtained from Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water that the company's proposed sewage pumping station in Llandaff North's Hailey Park will not lead to an exacerbation of this problem in Cardiff?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

I don't claim to be an expert in the sewage systems and rivers of Cardiff, but I know that this particular site, there was really good work by members of the Planning Committee who really worked diligently on this, local ward members have got a really good understanding of what's going on there, and I know that Save the Rivers in Cardiff, Councillor Berman, will have an absolute understanding of all this stuff. What I don't understand is, this is not a treatment plant which is what you're referring to.

Perhaps you could help me out here, what is it that that is doing, and what is it you think is going to go wrong in the technology there that could lead to the kind of distress that you're talking about in your question?

*Supplementary – Cllr Berman*

Have you had any conversations with Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water because the plan that was sighted in Cardigan was a relatively modern plant and yet has led to appalling discharges of sewage, so clearly Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water don't seem to have a particularly great track record. They don't seem to have been particularly honest about sewage discharges, and this has all been recently unearthed, and I thought that with a new plant being about to be delivered in Cardiff, whether it's the same kind of plant or not, that this Council would be immediately looking into seeking assurances from Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water that we are not going to have even more sewage dumping in our rivers. There is already horrendous sewage dumping in the Taf, the statistics are pretty bad, so I would hope that you would have now been trying to make sure that this latest development wasn't going to make that problem worse. So can you assure us that you have in fact had these conversations with Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water since these statistics came to light?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

I'm going to call this out, because you've been criticising people about misinformation; this sounds a lot like misinformation to me, you know full well that it's a pumping station. I offered you the opportunity to explain what it was about the pumping station that could lead to issues from treatment centres and sewage outlets, combined sewage outlets which are causing the problems. Pumping stations don't cause these problems, you know this and yet you keep calling it a treatment centre. I don't understand why you keep referring to it as such. Now our officers work incredibly hard with Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water and NRW, and I have absolutely no hesitation in saying that we expect the highest standards from Dŵr Cymru/Welsh Water. We expect NRW to hold them to those standards and we don't think that some of the work they have done in Cardiff has been good enough for the rivers throughout Wales, but I do think we owe it to the residents of Cardiff when we're talking about specific things in communities, we're clear about what they are, and that's the pumping station. You're talking about issues that aren't related to a pumping station, which I think is misleading people in general.

*Councillor Jenkins to Councillor Burke*

With the fantastic news about the new murals inspired by Cardiff's history and musical heritage, can the Cabinet Member tell me how other community and third sector groups can get involved in contributing towards murals and artworks across our great city?

*Reply – Cllr Burke*

The new murals in the subways beneath Boulevard de Nantes which was designed with Unify Creative and the Kingsway which was designed by Warlock Murals in the city centre were commissioned by the Cardiff Community Safety Partnership and were supported by Safer Streets grant from the Home Office. I would encourage any community group or third sector groups that are able to secure funding for any murals in Cardiff to work with Council officers to identify suitable locations and to work with local artists to help deliver their projects. Officers are currently compiling a

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*



database of artists interested in delivering these kinds of public art projects in order to build up a resource for any organisations wanting to deliver new murals in the city centre.

*Supplementary – Cllr Jenkins*

Just to thank the Cabinet Member for their response, that was wonderful and I look forward to many more murals in the city.

*Councillor McEvoy to Councillor Thomas*

Could the Council Leader justify his refusal to negotiate or talk to Cardiff Council trade unionists about the pay dispute, especially given the tough financial times families are going through?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

The strike action mandate that Unite has relates specifically to and only to a nationally negotiated pay award. So therefore the Council has not met Unite to discuss the specifically mandated strike, as any discussions regarding this is taking place with all trade unionists covered by the pay award and the national employers for local government services at a national level. And I know if we had met Unite locally to discuss pay issues, that would have been met with extreme hostility by the GMB and Unison. However, a number of meetings have taken place with Unite through various forums both locally and through the WLGA, there has also been communication with Unite at a local level and a regional one throughout the period of industrial action, and, as has been said already tonight, the Council has met with Unite and its other recognised trade unions through its usual trading and partnership arrangements. This has discussed any matters that Unite wish to raise, but not nationally negotiated. That commitment to meaningful dialogue is very clear.

*Supplementary – Cllr McEvoy*

You might in this letter say what you have just said, unless I've misunderstood, is untrue. It actually lists councils, Cumbria, Newham, Somerset, Wrexham, Tower Hamlets, who have entered into local negotiations. So will you formally enter into local negotiations with Unite, yes or no?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

We have engaged with Unite locally, in negotiations, an offer was made on Tuesday. To clarify, an offer relating to elements of the Green Book not covered by national negotiations.

*Councillor Davies to Councillor Thomas*

Will the Leader inform the Council how many times they have met with Unite the Union since industrial action commenced?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

I am tempted at this stage to refer to the answers that have been given throughout the night, but it is on several occasions that I have met with Unite, with WLGA officials or with Cardiff Council officials.

*Supplementary – Cllr Davies*

This oral question was tabled in accordance with the deadline, so I probably would've liked a numerical answer really. It's quite concerning actually to see Cllr Wild earlier in relation to another question talking about the British Government in relation to this pay dispute, because in the letters handed to us by Unite members on the way in there is no mention of it, but there is mention of Cardiff Council. It's the number one issue in our inboxes, and it's the number one expectation, I think, when it comes to people, of their council, so I'll probably just ask a very easy Yes or No question, does the Cardiff Council Labour Group support the industrial action in our city?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

I entirely understand why public sector workers across the country want a higher pay settlement, because we are faced with a cost of living crisis caused by the Tory Government, we've had 30 years of austerity delivered by the Tory Government. Local government workers have seen their salaries eroded during that time, and it's a fact of life that as a Council, and councils elsewhere, we are struggling to recruit, in no small part because of the erosion of public sector pay over the last 13 years.

But let's be very clear, any pay rise not fully funded from central government is going to have to be funded through service cuts and redundancies, and I've been very transparent with Unite the Union and others in terms of that position. I've also said this is nationally negotiated and that takes into account collective bargaining on the side of the unions and on the side of the Council, but we are committed to working with Unite to try and find a way locally through the resolution.

*Councillor Berman to Councillor De'Ath*

Based on the experience of schemes introduced in other parts of the UK, including in London, what estimate has the Council currently made regarding how much it would need to charge motorists a day for its proposed road user payment scheme in order to ensure the full costs of administering the scheme are covered, and how much more does it estimate it would need to charge motorists a day to also raise the £1-2 billion it considers is required to transform Cardiff's transport system?

*Reply – Cllr De'Ath*

I want to be really clear on two things and I've said right from the very start of this project, we want any payment to be fair, we want it to be modest. We absolutely appreciate the cost of living crisis, we don't want to worry people, I think you've probably heard me say that on several occasions in the past. Also, to be very clear, we are not proposing to raise £1-2 billion purely from a road user payment, the payment will form part of the funding mix and money will come from other sources as well. Looking at Nottingham, for example, they brought in a workplace parking levy they collected for their buses, it was match funded by the UK Government. At the moment we're at a very formative stage, lots of work and analysis going on, we'll be exploring different options and their consequences going forward.

*Supplementary – Cllr Berman*

I notice you refer to charges being modest and this is the thing that slightly concerns me because I don't know if you're aware, but when the congestion charge was as originally introduced in London, I believe that the Mayor when he brought it in was pledging that it wouldn't be more than £5 a day but not long after it had to be raised

to £8 a day because at £5 a day it wasn't actually bringing in enough revenue to cover the cost of administering the scheme, including all the infrastructure you have to run. I've seen it suggested it might be £1-2 a day or whatever, if that's what you're thinking of charging, the reality is you're unlikely to raise the sorts of money that you'd like to see invested in public transport. I know you're saying it's not the only source, but really we have to understand is, are you just trying to promise everything, a small charge and lots of investment, and in fact really all we're getting is an unachievable pipe dream?

*Reply – Cllr De’Ath*

We want to be really open about what we're doing. I think part of the issue is we're quite early on in the process when lots of this work hasn't been done. Going forward, these are the things we'll have to contend with, we'll have to tick lots of boxes. But you're a guy who prides himself on his green credentials, you intellectually understand what we're doing, it's what your group supported, I believe, during the consultation on the Transport White Paper. You know why we're doing it, and I'd like to engage in good faith and try and resist the lure of trashing it for political gain.

*Councillor Ferguson-Thorne to Councillor Thorne*

Can the Cabinet Member advise what is being done to address the rising levels of anti-social behaviour in inner city wards such as mine in Adamsdown, particularly where it is related to drug dealing and substance misuse?

*Reply – Cllr Thorne*

The Council works in close partnership with South Wales Police and other partners through the city's Community Safety Partnership to tackle anti-social behaviour through a data-led problem-solving approach. This work has included the successful implementation of CCTV provision along Clifton Street and at Anderson Fields and Brewery Park in Adamsdown, where drug related activities are known to occur. Additional CCTV assets are also scheduled for future redeployment in Pearl Street and in the vicinity of Cemetery Park.

The selection of these locations follows a comprehensive assessment of reported incidents provided by South Wales Police, community safety partners and the public. As part of the Operation Albarn, South Wales Police has recently undertaken plainclothes patrols in Adamsdown, which resulted in a number of arrests linked to drug related offences.

I am also aware that a 48-hour dispersal order is currently in place in Adamsdown, which came into effect from midnight on Wednesday and lasts until midnight tomorrow. This would provide South Wales Police officers with extra temporary powers to deal with anti-social behaviour in the area.

As I mentioned in my Council statement, the Community Safety Partnership is currently awaiting the outcome of its funding bid £150,000 as part of Round 5 of Home Office Safer Streets scheme. Round 5 focuses on initiatives targeting anti-social behaviour, and if successful, our bid will provide funding to support more interventions to tackle crime and anti-social behaviour in the Adamsdown area. This will include more CCTV provision, diversionary virtual reality education for young

people on better choices, referrals to the offer of scheme, improved gating of Anderson Fields, and a Police-operated drone to monitor potential incidents.

*Supplementary – Cllr Ferguson-Thorne*

Would the Cabinet Member commit to meeting with me and my ward colleagues in order to continue this work, because Operation Albarn has been a great asset to us but it would be great to be able to work on maintaining those outcomes so that levels do not rise again?

*Reply – Cllr Thorne*

I certainly welcome meeting with you, but not just you actually because there are issues in other inner-city wards where we have homeless hostels, and so I've been putting in place a plan so that we can meet with councillors from your ward, Riverside, Butetown and Splott, but it's taking a lot of organising because what I want is all partners there as well.

*Councillor Driscoll to Councillor Thomas*

Can the Council give the numbers of employees by department that have withdrawn their labour due to the recent industrial dispute and can the Leader give a statement on how this recent industrial action has impacted the functioning of the Council and delivery of essential services?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

In September there were a total of 278 employees taking strike action at some point during that period, with an average of 119 employees striking per day. That represents about 2.5% of the corporate workforce. For the first three weeks of October a total of 250 employees took strike action with an average of 142 employees striking per day, that is 1.8% of the corporate workforce. The main service areas that had employees on strike were: Recycling and Neighbourhood Services which had an average of about 109 employees striking per day during the period up to the middle of October, that's obviously waste services and cleansing; Housing and Communities, which had an average of 13 and a half striking in the first two weeks of industrial action then an average of 20 since, those employees were working mainly in housing repairs; and then within Resources, the central transport services had an average of 22 and a half employees striking in the first three weeks but since then no employees have been on strike in the last three weeks.

*Supplementary – Cllr Driscoll*

For the record, I support workers who wish to withdraw their labour, and as a group every year we do state at budget time, it's frontline workers who deserve the higher percentage pay settlements. I'm just looking for a bit of clarity really, it's stated in their letter by Unite that this industrial action could be settled locally, so somebody has got it wrong, is it the union or is it the Council?

*Reply – Cllr Thomas*

The Unite ballot in Cardiff is very clear, the dispute relates to the pay deal, as has been negotiated through the NJC. If there is a way of settling the dispute locally, we are open to that, as I've indicated previously. We have met with them, we have had a discussion about parts of the Green Book, terms and conditions aspects, not covered financial negotiations, to see whether there is common ground that we can find,

*This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg*

giving due consideration I must stress to the other recognised unions in the Council, but to find a shared way forward to resolve the dispute.

*Councillor Driscoll on behalf of Councillor Cowan to Councillor Wild*

How much (to date) has been saved in wages and on costs in Waste Management since the 2023 strikes started? Can this money be ring-fenced to provide additional green bin services to residents, in addition to the ones which are currently planned?

*Reply – Cllr Wild*

Thanks for your questions, Councillor Driscoll, and please pass on our best wishes to Councillor Cowan, we miss her in the Chamber. The service area is obviously tracking the finances associated with the ongoing industrial action, but we don't have a full picture until all of this is concluded and it's a pretty complex area, as you can imagine, across a number of different departments. Similarly, we are unable to commit to when and for how long the garden waste collections and I have given assurances already in this Chamber that we will make sure that we extend those if we need to and make sure that we catch up on the backlog of some of the garden waste collections.

*Supplementary – Cllr Driscoll*

Can I just take the opportunity to thank the Member for their best wishes for Councillor Cowan.

72 : URGENT BUSINESS

There was no urgent business.

73 : STANDARDS & ETHICS COMMITTEE INDEPENDENT MEMBER RE-APPOINTMENTS

Council was asked to approve the re-appointment of three independent members of the Standards and Ethics Committee.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Approve the re-appointment of (1) Jason Bartlett (2) Chrissie Nicholls and (3) Arthur Hallett, as independent members of the Standards and Ethics Committee, for a further consecutive four year term, expiring in each case, on 28<sup>th</sup> November 2027.

74 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

Council was asked to receive nominations and make appointments to current committee vacancies as set out in the report and in accordance with the approved allocation of seats and political group wishes.

RESOLVED: Council AGREED to:

Receive a nomination and appoint to the vacancy on the Committee, in accordance with the Party Group wishes, as set out in Table A and on the Amendment Sheet.

75 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

In accordance with Council Procedure Rule 17(f) [Written Questions](#) received for consideration together with the responses will be attached to the minutes.